## MATH 304 - Linear Algebra

In the last note we came up with a conjectural formulas for inverting square matrices. Let us recall our conjecture.

**Definition.** For any  $n \times n$  matrix A define  $A_{i,j}$  to be the matrix obtained from A by removing its i-th row and j-th column.

We predict that for every n there is a function  $\Delta_n$  which to any  $n \times n$  matrix A assigns a scalar  $\Delta_n(A)$ , called the **determinant** of A, which has the following properties:

- $\Delta_1([a]) = a.$
- $n \times n$  matrix A is invertible if and only if  $\Delta_n(A) \neq 0$ .
- For any  $n \times n$  matrix A define the matrix  $A^D$  to be the  $n \times n$  matrix whose i, j-entry is equal to  $(-1)^{i+j}\Delta_{n-1}(A_{j,i})$ , for  $1 \le i, j \le n$ . Then  $AA^D = \Delta_n(A)I = A^DA$ . In particular, if  $\Delta_n(A) \ne 0$  then

$$A^{-1} = \frac{1}{\Delta_n(A)} A^D$$

Comparing the 1, 1-entries on both sides of the equality  $AA^D = \Delta_n(A)I$  we see that if  $\Delta_n$  with the above property exist for all *n* then they must be given by the following recursive formula:

$$\Delta_1([a]) = a$$

$$\Delta_n(A) = a_{1,1}\Delta_{n-1}(A_{1,1}) - a_{1,2}\Delta_{n-1}(A_{1,2}) + \ldots + (-1)^{n+1}a_{1,n}\Delta_{n-1}(A_{1,n}) = \sum_{j=1}^n (-1)^{1+j}a_{1,j}\Delta_{n-1}(A_{1,j})$$

where  $A = [a_{i,j}]$ . For example, for  $A = \begin{bmatrix} a_{1,1} & a_{1,2} \\ a_{2,1} & a_{2,2} \end{bmatrix}$  we have

$$\Delta_2(A) = a_{1,1}\Delta_1([a_{2,2}]) - a_{1,2}\Delta_1([a_{2,1}]) = a_{1,1}a_{2,2} - a_{1,2}a_{2,1}$$

Now, for a 3 × 3 matrix  $A = \begin{bmatrix} a_{1,1} & a_{1,2} & a_{1,3} \\ a_{2,1} & a_{2,2} & a_{2,3} \\ a_{3,1} & a_{3,2} & a_{3,3} \end{bmatrix}$  we have

$$\begin{split} \Delta_3(A) &= a_{1,1} \Delta_2 \left( \begin{bmatrix} a_{2,2} & a_{2,3} \\ a_{3,2} & a_{3,3} \end{bmatrix} \right) - a_{1,2} \Delta_2 \left( \begin{bmatrix} a_{2,1} & a_{2,3} \\ a_{3,1} & a_{3,3} \end{bmatrix} \right) + a_{1,3} \Delta_2 \left( \begin{bmatrix} a_{2,1} & a_{2,2} \\ a_{3,1} & a_{3,2} \end{bmatrix} \right) = \\ &= a_{1,1}(a_{2,2}a_{3,3} - a_{2,3}a_{3,2}) - a_{1,2}(a_{2,1}a_{3,3} - a_{2,3}a_{3,1}) + a_{1,3}(a_{2,1}a_{3,2} - a_{2,2}a_{3,1}) = \\ &= a_{1,1}a_{2,2}a_{3,3} + a_{1,2}a_{2,3}a_{3,1} + a_{1,3}a_{2,1}a_{3,2} - a_{1,1}a_{2,3}a_{3,2} - a_{1,2}a_{2,1}a_{3,3} - a_{1,3}a_{2,2}a_{3,1}. \end{split}$$

And so on. What is left to show is that this unique possible  $\Delta_n$ 's given by the recursive formula indeed have the expected properties. In the previous note we have proved this for n = 2, 3. Proving this for all n requires a substantial effort. It turns out that the determinant has many other interesting properties.

After all this discussion let us one more time state our recursive definition of  $\Delta_n$ 

**Definition.** To any  $n \times n$  matrix  $A = [a_{i,j}]$  we assign a scalar  $\Delta_n(A)$ , called the **determinant** of A, as follows:

$$\Delta_1([a]) = a,$$

$$\Delta_n(A) = a_{1,1}\Delta_{n-1}(A_{1,1}) - a_{1,2}\Delta_{n-1}(A_{1,2}) + \ldots + (-1)^{n+1}a_{1,n}\Delta_{n-1}(A_{1,n}) = \sum_{j=1}^n (-1)^{1+j}a_{1,j}\Delta_{n-1}(A_{1,j}).$$

Theorem. The determinant has the following properties.

- 1.  $\Delta_n(I) = 1;$
- 2.  $\Delta_n(A) = 0$  if two consecutive rows of A are equal.
- 3. We write  $\Delta_n(r_1, ..., r_n)$  for  $\Delta_n(A)$  when the *i*-th row of A is  $r_i$  for i = 1, 2, ..., n. Then, we have

$$\Delta_n(r_1, ..., ar'_i + br''_i, ..., r_n) = a\Delta_n(r_1, ..., r'_i, ..., r_n) + b\Delta_n(r_1, ..., r''_i, ..., r_n)$$

for any  $i, 1 \leq i \leq n$ .

- 4.  $\Delta_n(B) = -\Delta_n(A)$  if B is obtained from A by switching two consecutive rows.
- 5.  $\Delta_n(B) = -\Delta_n(A)$  if B is obtained from A by switching any two rows. In other words,  $\Delta_n(S_{i,j}A) = -\Delta_n(A)$ .
- 6.  $\Delta_n(A) = 0$  if two rows of A are equal.
- 7.  $\Delta_n(E_{i,j}(a)A) = \Delta_n(A)$
- 8.  $\Delta_n(D_i(a)A) = a\Delta_n(A)$
- 9.  $\Delta_n(A) = 0$  if A has a zero row.
- 10.  $\Delta_n(E_{i,j}(a)) = 1$ ,  $\Delta_n(D_i(a)) = a$  and  $\Delta_n(S_{i,j}) = -1$ .
- 11.  $\Delta_n(EB) = \Delta_n(E)\Delta_n(B)$  for any elementary matrix E and any matrix B.
- 12. If A is invertible then  $\Delta_n(A) \neq 0$  and  $\Delta_n(AB) = \Delta_n(A)\Delta_n(B)$  for any B;
- 13. A is singular if and only if  $\Delta_n(A) = 0$ . In other words, A is invertible if and only if  $\Delta_n(A) \neq 0$ .
- 14.  $\Delta_n(AB) = \Delta_n(A)\Delta_n(B)$  for any A, B;
- 15.  $\Delta_n(A^t) = \Delta_n(A)$  (here  $A^t$  is the transpose of A)
- 16. Laplace expansion by the *i*-th row (i = 1, 2, ..., n):

$$\Delta_n(A) = \sum_{j=1}^n (-1)^{i+j} a_{i,j} \Delta_{n-1}(A_{i,j}).$$

17. If  $1 \leq i, k \leq n$  and  $k \neq i$  then

$$0 = \sum_{j=1}^{n} (-1)^{i+j} a_{k,j} \Delta_{n-1}(A_{i,j}).$$

18.

$$AA^D = \Delta_n(A)I = A^D A.$$

19. Laplace expansion by the *j*-th column (j = 1, 2, ..., n):

$$\Delta_n(A) = \sum_{i=1}^n (-1)^{i+j} a_{i,j} \Delta_{n-1}(A_{i,j}), \ j = 1, 2, ..., n,$$

20. If  $1 \leq j, k \leq n$  and  $k \neq j$  then

$$0 = \sum_{i=1}^{n} (-1)^{i+k} a_{i,j} \Delta_{n-1}(A_{i,k}).$$

*Proof:* The proof will consist of several steps. First, we will establish properties 1,2,3. Then we will derive properties 4-15 from properties 1-3. Finally, we will establish properties 16-20.

**Property 1.** Note that if I is  $n \times n$  identity matrix then  $I_{1,1}$  is the  $(n-1) \times (n-1)$  identity matrix. Thus our definition of  $\Delta_n$  yields  $\Delta_n(I) = \Delta_{n-1}(I)$ . Repeating this reasoning we see that

$$\Delta_n(I) = \Delta_{n-1}(I) = \ldots = \Delta_1(I) = \Delta_1([1]) = 1.$$

(Note that above we use I to denote the identity matrix of any size; the appropriate size follows from the context.)

**Property 2.** This is the hardest part of the proof. We will first obtain a formula for the determinant, which is of interests in its own right. In what follows, we assume that n is at least 3. Recall the defining formula

$$\Delta_n(A) = \sum_{j=1}^n (-1)^{1+j} a_{1,j} \Delta_{n-1}(A_{1,j})$$

Now we apply the defining formula to each  $\Delta_{n-1}(A_{1,j})$ . For  $1 \leq s < t \leq n$ , let B(s,t) be the matrix obtained from A by removing its first two rows and both s-th and t-th columns. It is easy to see that  $(A_{1,j})_{1,k} = B(k,j)$  if k < j and  $(A_{1,j})_{1,k} = B(j,k+1)$  if  $k \geq j$ . Also, the 1, k-entry of  $A_{1,j}$  is  $a_{2,k}$  if k < j and it is  $a_{2,k+1}$  if  $k \geq j$ . Thus

$$\Delta_{n-1}(A_{1,j}) = \sum_{1 \le k < j} a_{2,k} \Delta_{n-2}(B(k,j))(-1)^{1+k} + \sum_{j \le k < n} a_{2,k+1} \Delta_{n-2}(B(j,k+1))(-1)^{1+k}.$$

Inserting these formulas into our formula for  $\Delta_n$ , we get then the following formula:

$$\Delta_n(A) = \sum_{j=1}^n (-1)^{1+j} a_{1,j} \sum_{1 \le k < j} a_{2,k} \Delta_{n-2}(B(k,j))(-1)^{1+k} + \sum_{j=1}^n (-1)^{1+j} a_{1,j} \sum_{j \le k < n} a_{2,k+1} \Delta_{n-2}(B(j,k+1))(-1)^{1+k} = \sum_{1 \le k < j \le n} (-1)^{2+j+k} a_{1,j} a_{2,k} \Delta_{n-2}(B(k,j)) + \sum_{1 \le j \le k < n} (-1)^{2+j+k} a_{1,j} a_{2,k+1} \Delta_{n-2}(B(j,k+1)).$$

The last sum can be written in terms of s = k + 1 as follows:

1

$$\sum_{\leq j < s \leq n} (-1)^{1+j+s} a_{1,j} a_{2,s} \Delta_{n-2}(B(j,s))$$

and changing the name of j into k and s into j it is

$$\sum_{1 \le k < j \le n} (-1)^{1+k+j} a_{1,k} a_{2,j} \Delta_{n-2}(B(k,j)).$$

Thus we get the promised formula for  $\Delta_n$ :

$$\Delta_n(A) = \sum_{1 \le k < j \le n} (-1)^{2+j+k} a_{1,j} a_{2,k} \Delta_{n-2}(B(k,j)) + \sum_{1 \le k < j \le n} (-1)^{1+k+j} a_{1,k} a_{2,j} \Delta_{n-2}(B(k,j)) = \sum_{1 \le k < j \le n} (-1)^{1+j+k} (a_{1,k} a_{2,j} - a_{1,j} a_{2,k}) \Delta_{n-2}(B(k,j)).$$

Suppose now that the first two rows of A coincide:  $a_{1,j} = a_{2,j}$  for j = 1, ..., n. Then each term  $a_{1,j}a_{2,k} - a_{1,k}a_{2,j}$  in the above formula is 0 and consequently  $\Delta_n(A) = 0$ . Thus we proved that if the first two rows of A coincide then  $\Delta_n(A) = 0$  (we did it for  $n \ge 3$ ; for n = 2 this is straightforward).

Now we can prove the full Property 2. We already know that it holds for n = 2. Suppose we have established the property for all sizes smaller than n. Let A be an  $n \times n$  matrix with two consecutive rows equal. If the first 2 rows of A are equal, we already proved that  $\Delta_n(A) = 0$ . If rows k and k + 1 of A are equal for some k > 1, then each matrix  $A_{1,j}$  has two equal rows. Since the size of  $A_{1,j}$  is smaller than n, we know that  $\Delta_n(A_{1,j}) = 0$  for  $j = 1, \ldots, n$ . Our defining formula for the determinant implies that  $\Delta_n(A) = 0$ . This completes our argument. **Property 3.** We establish this property using technique similar to the one employed at the end of our proof of Property 2. Namely, it is clear that Property 3 holds for  $1 \times 1$  matrices. Now suppose that we already established Property 3 for matrices of size less than n. We will show that the property holds for matrices of size n (the method we use is called **mathematical induction**).

Let A be the matrix with rows  $r_1, ..., ar'_i + br''_i, ..., r_n$ , let B be the matrix with rows  $r_1, ..., r'_i, ..., r_n$ , and let C be the matrix with rows  $r_1, ..., r''_i, ..., r_n$ . Thus we need to show that  $\Delta_n(A) = a\Delta_n(B) + b\Delta_n(C)$ We consider two cases.

<u>**case 1:**</u> i = 1. In this case, we have  $A_{1,j} = B_{1,j} = C_{1,j}$  for j = 1, ..., n. Let  $r'_1 = (a'_{1,1}, ..., a'_{1,n})$ ,  $r''_1 = (a''_{1,1}, ..., a''_{1,n})$ , so  $r_1 = (aa'_{1,1} + ba''_{1,1}, ..., aa'_{1,n} + ba''_{1,n})$ . Using our definition of the determinant, we have

$$\Delta_n(A) = \sum_{j=1}^n (-1)^{1+j} (aa'_{1,1} + ba''_{1,1}) \Delta_{n-1}(A_{1,j}) = a \sum_{j=1}^n (-1)^{1+j} a'_{1,1} \Delta_{n-1}(B_{1,j}) + b \sum_{j=1}^n (-1)^{1+j} a'_{1,1} \Delta_{n-1}(C_{1,j}) = a \Delta_n(B) + b \Delta_n(C),$$

so Property 3 is true in this case.

**<u>case 2:**</u> i > 1. In this case, for j = 1, ..., n, the i - 1st row of  $A_{1,j}$  (which corresponds to *i*-th row of A) is equal to the sum of a times the i - 1st row of  $B_{1,j}$  and b times the i - 1st row of  $C_{1,j}$ . Moreover, for  $k \neq i$  the k-th rows of  $A_{1,j}$ ,  $B_{1,j}$ ,  $C_{1,j}$  coincide. Since we assume that Property 3 holds for matrices of size less than n, we get

$$\Delta_{n-1}(A_{1,j}) = a\Delta_{n-1}(B_{1,j}) + b\Delta_{n-1}(C_{1,j}) \text{ for } j = 1, \dots, n.$$

Since A, B, C have the same first row  $(a_{1,1}, \ldots, a_{1,n})$ , we get

$$\Delta_n(A) = \sum_{j=1}^n (-1)^{1+j} \Delta_{n-1}(A_{1,j}) = \sum_{j=1}^n (-1)^{1+j} (a \Delta_{n-1}(B_{1,j}) + b \Delta_{n-1}(C_{1,j})) = a \sum_{j=1}^n (-1)^{1+j} \Delta_{n-1}(B_{1,j}) + b \sum_{j=1}^n (-1)^{1+j} \Delta_{n-1}(C_{1,j}) = a \Delta_n(B) + b \Delta_n(C),$$

so Property 3 is true in this case as well.

This completes our first step of establishing properties 1,2,3. Now we will see that these three properties imply properties 1-15.

**Property 4.** Let the rows of A be  $r_1, \ldots, r_n$  suppose that B is obtained from A by switching rows k and k + 1. Thus,

$$\Delta_n(A) = \Delta_n(r_1, \dots, r_k, r_{k+1}, \dots, r_n) \text{ and } \Delta_n(B) = \Delta_n(r_1, \dots, r_{k+1}, r_k, \dots, r_n).$$

From property 2 we get that  $\Delta_n(r_1, \ldots, r_k + r_{k+1}, r_k + r_{k+1}, \ldots, r_n) = 0$  (since rows k and k+1 coincide). On the other hand, using property 3 we get

$$\Delta_{n}(r_{1},\ldots,r_{k}+r_{k+1},r_{k}+r_{k+1},\ldots,r_{n}) = \Delta_{n}(r_{1},\ldots,r_{k},r_{k}+r_{k+1},\ldots,r_{n}) + \Delta_{n}(r_{1},\ldots,r_{k+1},r_{k}+r_{k+1},\ldots,r_{n}) = \\ = \Delta_{n}(r_{1},\ldots,r_{k},r_{k},\ldots,r_{n}) + \Delta_{n}(r_{1},\ldots,r_{k},r_{k+1},\ldots,r_{n}) + \Delta_{n}(r_{1},\ldots,r_{k+1},r_{k},\ldots,r_{n}) + \Delta_{n}(r_{1},\ldots,r_{k+1},r_{k+1},\ldots,r_{n}).$$
Since  $\Delta_{n}(r_{1},\ldots,r_{k},r_{k},\ldots,r_{n}) = 0 = \Delta_{n}(r_{1},\ldots,r_{k+1},r_{k+1},\ldots,r_{n}),$  we conclude that

$$0 = \Delta_n(r_1, \dots, r_k, r_{k+1}, \dots, r_n) + \Delta_n(r_1, \dots, r_{k+1}, r_k, \dots, r_n) = \Delta_n(A) + \Delta_n(B)$$

i.e.  $\Delta_n(B) = -\Delta_n(A)$ .

**Property 5.** Suppose that *B* is obtained from *A* by switching rows *k* and *l* with k < l. This can be achieved by several switches of consecutive rows, namely switch rows *k* and k+1, then k+1, k+2,..., then l-1, l then l-2, l-1,..., then finally k+1, k. We performed a total of (l-k) + (l-k-1) = 2(l-k) - 1 switches of consecutive rows. By property 4, each times we switch two consecutive rows, the determinant

changes sign. Thus, to get  $\Delta_n(B)$  we need to switch the sign of  $\Delta_n(A)$  an odd number of times, so  $\Delta_n(B) = -\Delta_n(A)$ .

**Property 6.** If rows k and l of A are equal, k < l, then let B be obtained from A by switching rows k+1 and l. By property 5,  $\Delta_n(B) = -\Delta_n(A)$ . Since B has two consecutive rows equal, we get  $\Delta_n(B) = 0$  by property 2. Thus  $\Delta_n(A) = 0$ .

**Property 7.** Let  $r_1, \ldots, r_n$  be the rows of A. Then  $E_{i,j}(a)A$  has *i*-th row equal to  $r_i + ar_j$  and *k*-th rows of A and  $E_{i,j}(a)A$  coincide for  $k \neq i$ . By property 3, we have

$$\Delta_n(E_{i,j}(a)A) = \Delta_n(r_1, \dots, r_{i-1}, r_i + ar_j, \dots, r_n) = \Delta_n(r_1, \dots, r_{i-1}, r_i, \dots, r_n) + a\Delta_n(r_1, \dots, r_{i-1}, r_j, \dots, r_n).$$

Note that  $\Delta_n(r_1, \ldots, r_{i-1}, r_i, \ldots, r_n) = \Delta_n(A)$  and, by property 6,  $\Delta_n(r_1, \ldots, r_{i-1}, r_j, \ldots, r_n) = 0$ , since the *i*th and *j*th rows are the same. Thus  $\Delta_n(E_{i,j}(a)A) = \Delta_n(A)$ .

**Property 8.** This property is a special case of property 3, with b = 0 (recall that  $D_i(a)A$  is obtained from A by multiplying the *i*-th row of A by a).

**Property 9.** Suppose that the *i*-th row of A is zero. Then  $D_i(2)A = A$ . Thus, by property 8,

$$2\Delta_n(A) = \Delta_n(D_i(2)A) = \Delta_n(A)$$

which clearly implies that  $\Delta_n(A) = 0$ .

**Property 10.** This follows immediately from property 1 and properties 7,8,5 respectively applied to the matrix A = I.

**Property 11.** This follows immediately from property 10 and property 7 if  $E = E_{i,j}(a)$ , property 8 if  $A = D_i(a)$ , and property 5 if  $E = S_{i,j}$ .

**Property 12.** If A is invertible then  $A = E_1 \dots E_k$  for some elementary matrices  $E_1, \dots, E_k$ . By property 11, for any matrix B we have

$$\Delta_n(AB) = \Delta_n(E_1 \dots E_k B) = \Delta_n(E_1)\Delta_n(E_2 \dots E_k B) = \dots = \Delta_n(E_1)\Delta_n(E_2)\dots\Delta_n(E_k)\Delta_n(B).$$

Using B = I we get  $\Delta_n(A) = \Delta_n(E_1)\Delta_n(E_2)\dots\Delta_n(E_k) \neq 0$  since each  $\Delta_n(E_i) \neq 0$  by property 10. Returning to arbitrary B, we get

$$\Delta_n(AB) = \Delta_n(E_1)\Delta_n(E_2)\dots\Delta_n(E_k)\Delta_n(B) = \Delta_n(A)\Delta_n(B).$$

**Property 13.** If A is not singular than A is invertible and  $\Delta_n(A) \neq 0$  by property 12.

Suppose now that A is singular and let B be the reduced row echelon form of A. Since A is singular, the last row of B is zero. Thus  $\Delta_n(B) = 0$  by property 9. There is and invertible matrix M such that A = MB (since A, B are row equivalent). Thus, using property 12,

$$\Delta_n(A) = \Delta_n(MB) = \Delta_n(M)\Delta_n(B) = 0.$$

**Property 14.** If A is invertible, the result follows from property 12. If A is singular then AB is singular too. By property 13, we have  $\Delta_n(A) = 0 = \Delta_n(AB)$ , so the results holds in this case as well.

**Property 15.** Recall that  $E_{i,j}(a)^t = E_{j,i}(a)$ ,  $D_i(a)^t = D_i(a)$  and  $S_{i,j}^t = S_{i,j}$ . It follows that  $\Delta_n(E) = \Delta_n(E^t)$  if E is an elementary matrix. If A is singular then so is  $A^t$  and we have  $\Delta_n(A) = 0 = \Delta_n(A^t)$ . If A is invertible then  $A = E_1 \dots E_k$  for some elementary matrices  $E_1, \dots, E_k$ . Then  $A^t = E_k^t \dots E_1^t$  and

$$\Delta_n(A) = \Delta_n(E_1)\Delta_n(E_2)\dots\Delta_n(E_k) = \Delta_n(E_1^t)\Delta_n(E_2^t)\dots\Delta_n(E_k^t) = \Delta_n(E_k^t)\dots\Delta_n(E_2^t)\Delta_n(E_1^t) = \Delta_n(A^t).$$

This completes our second step (which shows that properties 4-15 are consequences of properties 1-3, i.e. any function of matrices with properties 1-3 must have properties 4-15). Our last step is to get properties 16-20.

**Property 16.** Let  $r_1, \ldots, r_n$  be the rows of A and let B be the matrix with rows  $r_i, r_1, \ldots, r_{i-1}, r_{i+1}, \ldots, r_n$ . Clearly  $A_{i,j} = B_{1,j}$  for  $j = 1, \ldots, n$ . Note that B can be obtained from A by switching rows i and i-1, Then i-1 and i-2, ..., then 2 and 1. This requires i-1 switches. It follows that  $\Delta_n(B) = (-1)^{i-1} \Delta_n(A)$ . Since the first row of B is  $(a_{i,1}, \ldots, a_{i,n})$ , we have

$$(-1)^{i-1}\Delta_n(A) = \Delta_n(B) = \sum_{j=1}^n (-1)^{1+j} a_{i,j} \Delta_{n-1}(B_{1,j}) = \sum_{j=1}^n (-1)^{1+j} a_{i,j} \Delta_{n-1}(A_{i,j}).$$

Multiplying both sides by  $(-1)^{i-1}$  we get

$$\Delta_n(A) = (-1)^{i-1} \sum_{j=1}^n (-1)^{1+j} a_{i,j} \Delta_{n-1}(A_{i,j}) = \sum_{j=1}^n (-1)^{i+j} a_{i,j} \Delta_{n-1}(A_{i,j}).$$

**Property 17.** Let *B* be the matrix obtained from *A* by replacing the *i*-th row of *A* by *k*-th row of *A*. Thus the *i*-th and *k*-th rows of *B* coincide and therefore  $\Delta_n(B) = 0$  by property 6. Clearly  $B_{i,j} = A_{i,j}$  for  $j = 1, \ldots, n$ . Since the *i*-th row of *B* is  $(a_{k,1}, \ldots, a_{k,n})$ , the Laplace expansion by the *i*-th row of *B* (property 16) yields

$$0 = \Delta_n(B) = \sum_{j=1}^n (-1)^{i+j} a_{k,j} \Delta_{n-1}(B_{i,j}) = \sum_{j=1}^n (-1)^{i+j} a_{k,j} \Delta_{n-1}(A_{i,j}).$$

**Property 18.** Note that the *i*, *i*-entry of  $AA^D$  is given by the right side of the formula in property 15. Hence the diagonal entries of  $AA^D$  are all equal to  $\Delta_n(A)$ . For  $k \neq i$ , the *k*, *i*-entry of  $AA^D$  is given by the right side of the formula in property 17. Thus the off-diagonal entries of  $AA^D$  are all zero. This proves that  $AA^D = \Delta_n(A)I$ .

Consider now the transpose  $A^t$  of A. It is clear that  $(A^t)_{i,j} = (A_{j,i})^t$ . Since  $\Delta_n((A_{j,i})^t) = \Delta_n(A_{j,i})$ by property 15, we see that  $(A^t)^D = (A^D)^t$ . Since we know that  $A^t(A^t)^D = \Delta_n(A^t)I$ , we conclude that  $A^t(A^D)^t = \Delta_n(A)I$ . Transposing both sides of the last equality we get

$$\Delta_n(A)I = (\Delta_n(A)I)^t = (A^t(A^D)^t)^t = ((A^D)^t)^t (A^t)^t = A^D A.$$

**Property 19.** Note that the right hand side of the formula in property 19 is equal to the j, j-entry of  $A^D A$ , which is  $\Delta_n(A)$  by property 18.

**Property 20.** Note that the right hand side of the formula in property 20 is equal to the k, j-entry of  $A^D A$ , which is 0 by property 18.

This completes the justification of properties 1-20.

**Exercise:** Show that  $(AB)^D = B^D A^D$  (this is quite easy when A or B is invertible, but more subtle in the remaining case).